



July 20, 2023

ADHD Online
109 Michigan Street, NE, Suite 419
Grand Rapids, MI 49503
Attn: Zachariah Booker, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Booker,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Advocate Aurora Health
750 West Virginia St.
Milwaukee, WI 53204
Attn: Nick Turkal, President & CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Turkal,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Alfie
222 Broadway, 19th Floor
New York, NY 10038
Attn: Alexander Singh, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Singh,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023-186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023-169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Alpha
555 Bryant St., Suite 814
Palo Alto, CA 94301
Attn: Gloria Lau, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Lau,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Apostrophe
2269 Chestnut St., #523
San Francisco, CA 94123
Attn: Soleil Boughton, Chief Legal Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Boughton,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021),

https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Array Behavioral Care
1120 NJ-73, Suite #300
Mount Laurel Township, NJ 08054
Attn: Geoffrey Boyce, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Boyce,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023-186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Ascension
4600 Edmundson Rd.
St. Louis, MO 63134
Attn: Christine Kocot McCoy, Executive Vice President and General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. McCoy,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Barnes-Jewish Hospital
4901 Forest Park Avenue, Suite 1140
St. Louis, MO 63108
Attn: Sally Terrace, Senior Vice President & General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Terrace,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Barton Healthcare System
2170 South Ave.
South Lake Tahoe, CA 96150
Attn: Clint Purvance, M.D., President & CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Dr. Purvance,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Beaumont Health System
26901 Beaumont Blvd.
Southfield, MI 48033-3849
Attn: Terese Farhat, Senior Vice President & General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Farhat,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Bellin Health
744 South Webster Ave.
P.O. Box 23400
Green Bay, WI 54305-7373
Attn: Chris Woleske, President

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Woleske,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Bicycle Health
68 Harrison Ave., Suite 600
Boston, MA 02111
Attn: Ankit Gupta, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Gupta,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Bon Secours Mercy Health
1701 Mercy Health Place
Cincinnati, OH 45237
Attn: Michael Bezney, Chief Legal Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Bezney,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Boulder Care
111 SW Naito Parkway, Suite 200
Portland, OR 97204
Attn: Ben Maclean, General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Maclean,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Brigham and Women's Faulkner Hospital
1153 Centre St.
Boston, MA 02130
Attn: James Bryant, Vice President & Chief Compliance Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Bryant,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Brightline
400 Concar Dr.
San Mateo, CA 94402
Attn: Sarah Weatherhead, General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Weatherhead,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Brightside
5214F Diamond Heights Blvd., # 3422
San Francisco, CA 94131-2175
Attn: Brad Kittredge, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Kittredge,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Calibrate
85 Fifth Avenue, 8th Floor
New York, NY 10003
Attn: Isabelle Kenyon, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Kenyon,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

CallonDoc
8355 Walnut Hill Ln.
Dallas, TX 75231
Attn: TJ Oshun, M.D., CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Dr. Oshun,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Cedars-Sinai Medical Center
6500 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 2250
Los Angeles, CA 90048
Attn: Terri Wagner Cammarano, SVP of Legal Affairs and General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Cammarano,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Chesapeake Regional Healthcare
736 North Battlefield Blvd.
Chesapeake, VA 23320
Attn: Daniel Mitchell, Chief Corporate Compliance Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Mitchell,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Children's Wisconsin
999 N. 92nd Street
Milwaukee, WI 53226
Attn: Peggy Troy, President & CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Troy,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Cone Health
1200 North Elm Street
Greensboro, NC 27401
Attn: Robert Carter, VP and General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Carter,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Cove
c/o Thirty Madison, Inc.
82 Nassau St., #61392
New York, NY 10038
Attn: Demetri Karagas

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Karagas,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Covenant Health
100 Fort Sanders West Blvd.
Knoxville, TN 37922
Attn: Doug Campbell, General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Campbell,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Curology
353 Sacramento St., 20th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111
Attn: Heather Wallace, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Wallace,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

DearBrightly
447 Sutter St., Suite 405
San Francisco, CA 94108
Attn: Amy Chiu, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Chiu,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Done
548 Market St.
PMB 99481
San Francisco, CA 94104
Attn: Ruthia He, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. He,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Dorsal
600 3rd Ave., Floor 2
New York, NY 10016
Attn: Andrew Jin, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Jin,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Duke University Health System
310 Blackwell Street, 4th Floor
Box 104124
Durham, NC 27710
Attn: Pamela J. Bernard, Vice President and General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Bernard,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

El Camino Hospital
2500 Grant Rd.
Mountain View, CA 94040
Attn: Mary Rotunno, General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Rotunno,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Eleanor Health
221 Crescent Street, Suite 202
Waltham, MA 02453
Attn: Corbin Petro, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Petro,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Elektra Health
719 Dean Street, #4F
Brooklyn, NY 11238
Attn: Alessandra Henderson, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Henderson,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Everlywell
823 Congress Ave., Suite 1200
Austin, TX 78701
Attn: Julia Cheek, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Cheek,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Facet
c/o Thirty Madison, Inc.
82 Nassau St., #61392
New York, NY 10038
Attn: Steven Gutentag, CEO, Thirty Madison

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Gutentag,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Favor
951 Mariners Island Blvd., Suite 300
San Mateo, CA 94402
Attn: Liz Meyerdirk, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Meyerdirk,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Folx
One Boston Place
Boston, MA 02108
Attn: Liana Douillet Guzmán

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Guzmán,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Found

1 Letterman Dr., C3500
San Francisco, CA 94129
Attn: Sarah Jones Simmer, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Simmer,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Froedtert Hospital and the Medical College of Wisconsin
9200 W. Wisconsin Ave.
Milwaukee, WI 53226
Attn: Amy Marquardt, Senior VP, Chief Legal Officer, and General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Marquardt,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Gennev
11335 NE 122nd Way, Suite 105
Kirkland, WA 98034-6933
Attn: Jill Angelo, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Angelo,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Grady Health System
80 Jesse Hill Jr. Drive SE
Atlanta, GA 30303-3031
Attn: Timothy Jefferson, Chief Legal Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Jefferson,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Hentry Ford Hopsital
c/o Henry Ford Health
2799 W Grand Blvd.
Detroit, MI 48202
Attn: Michelle Johnson Tidjani, Executive VP & General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Tidjani,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Hers
2269 Chestnut Street, #523
San Francisco, CA 94123
Attn: Soleil Boughton, Chief Legal Officer, Hims & Hers

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Boughton,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Hims
2269 Chestnut Street, #523
San Francisco, CA 94123
Attn: Soleil Boughton, Chief Legal Officer, Hims & Hers

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Boughton,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Hone Health
154 W 14th Street, Suite 6-110
New York, NY 10011
Attn: Saad Alam, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Alam,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Honor Health
8125 N. Hayden Rd.
Scottsdale, AZ 85258
Attn: Shannon Fox Fraser, Senior VP & General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Fraser,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Houston Methodist
6565 Fannin St.
Houston, TX 77030
Attn: Ramon M. Cantu, Executive VP & Chief Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Cantu,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Inova Health System
8110 Gatehouse Rd.
Falls Church, VA 22042
Attn: John Gaul, Chief Legal Officer & General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Gaul,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Invigor Medical
3180 W Clearwater Ave., Suite G
Kennewick, WA 99336
Attn: Michael Hillman, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Hillman,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Johns Hopkins Hospital
1812 Ashland Avenue, Suite 300
Baltimore, MD 21205
Attn: Annemarie Martin-Boyan, Senior VP & General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Martin-Boyan,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

K Health
1133 Broadway, Suite 204
New York, NY 10010
Attn: Chen Yehudai, General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Yehudai,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Keeps
c/o Thirty Madison, Inc.
82 Nassau St., #61392
New York, NY 10038
Attn: Steven Gutentag, CEO, Thirty Madison

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Gutentag,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Kick Health
522 W. Riverside Ave., Suite 8030
Spokane, WA 99201
Attn: Justin Ip, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Ip,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

KwikMed
7033 E. Greenway Pkwy., Suite 310
Scottsdale, AZ 85254
Attn: Peter Ax, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Ax,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

LCMC Health System
1100 Poydras Street
2500 Energy Center
New Orleans, LA 70163
Attn: Jody Martin, Chief Legal Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Martin,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023-186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Lemonaid
349 Oyster Point Blvd.
South San Francisco, CA 94080
Attn: Paul Johnson, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Johnson,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Loyola Medicine
2160 S. First Ave.
Maywood, IL 60153
Attn: Jill Rappis, Senior Vice President & General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Rappis,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Mantra Health
228 Park Ave. South
PMB 70930
New York, NY 10003-1502
Attn: Matt Kennedy, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Kennedy,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023-186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Marshall Medical Center
1100 Marshall Way
Placerville, CA 95667
Attn: Lisa Kissel, Compliance and Privacy Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Kissel,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

MedStar Health
10980 Grantchester Way
Columbia, MD 21044
Attn: Oliver M. Johnson II, EVP, Chief Administrative Officer, and General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Johnson,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Memorial Healthcare System
3111 Stirling Rd.
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33312-6566
Attn: Frank Rainer, Senior Vice President and General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Rainer,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

MemorialCare Long Beach Medical Center
17360 Brookhurst St.
Fountain Valley, CA 92708
Attn: Barry Arbuckle, President & CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Arbuckle,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Mercy Medical Center
345 St. Paul Pl.
Baltimore, MD 21202
Attn: David N. Maine, M.D., President & CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Dr. Maine,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Middlesex Health
28 Crescent St.
Middletown, CT 06457-3654
Attn: Vincent G. Capece, Jr., CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Capece,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Mindbloom
1317 Edgewater Dr., #1583
Orlando, FL 32804
Attn: Dylan Beynon, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Beynon,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Minded
122 Grand Street
New York, NY 10013
Attn: David Ronick, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Ronick,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Mistr
1521 Alton Road, #463
Miami Beach, FL 33139
Attn: Tristan Schukraft, President and CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Schukraft,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

MultiCare Health System
316 Martin Luther King, Jr. Way
Tacoma, WA 98405-4252
Attn: Mark Gary, Senior VP and General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Gary,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Musely
3300 Central Expressway, Suite C
Santa Clara, CA 95051
Attn: Jack Jia, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Jia,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

My Ketamine Home
1330 Coral Way, Suite 200
Miami, FL 33145
Attn: Kazi Hassan, M.D., Medical Director and CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Dr. Hassan,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Nemours Children's Health
10140 Centurion Parkway
North Jacksonville, FL 32256
Attn: Laura Kowal, Senior Vice President & General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Kowal,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

New York Presbyterian Hospital
466 Lexington Ave., 13th Floor
New York, NY 10017
Attn: Mary Beth Claus, Chief Legal Officer, & General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Claus,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Northwestern Medicine Central DuPage Hospital
25 North Winfield Rd.
Winfield, IL 60190
Attn: Julia Kelleher Lynch, Senior VP and General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Lynch,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Northwestern Memorial Healthcare
251 E. Huron St., 4th Floor
Feinberg Pavilion
Chicago, IL 60611
Attn: Howard B. Chrisman, MD, President and CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Dr. Chrisman,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Nue Life
309 23rd Street, Suite 220
Miami Beach, FL 33140
Attn: Juan Pablo Cappello, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Cappello,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Nurx
548 Market Street, Suite # 94061
San Francisco, CA 94104-5401
Attn: Emily Rymland, Medical Director

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Rymland,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Oar
c/o Soho Works
55 Water Street
Brooklyn, NY 11201
Attn: Jonathan Hunt-Glassman, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Hunt-Glassman,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Ophelia
228 Park Ave South, Suite 15314
New York, NY 10003
Attn: Zack Gray, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Gray,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Peace Health
1115 SE 164th Ave.
Vancouver, WA 98683-9324
Attn: Tom Karnes, Senior VP & General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Karnes,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Penn Medicine Chester County Hospital
701 E Marshall St.
West Chester, PA 19380
Attn: Michael J. Duncan, President and CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Duncan,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Penn Medicine
FMC Tower at Cira Centre South
2929 Walnut St., Suite 400
Philadelphia, PA 19104-5099
Attn: Wendy White, Senior VP and General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. White,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Picnic

c/o Thirty Madison, Inc.

82 Nassau St., #61392

New York, NY 10038

Attn: Steven Gutentag, CEO, Thirty Madison

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Gutentag,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Piedmont Healthcare
1800 Howell Mill Road, Suite 350
Atlanta, GA 30318
Attn: Kevin Brown, President and CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Brown,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Plume
303 S. Broadway, #200-357
Denver, CO 80209
Attn: Matthew Wetschler, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Wetschler,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

PRJKT RUBY
7033 E. Greenway Pkwy., Suite 310
Scottsdale, AZ 85254
Attn: Peter Ax, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Ax,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Push Health
1730 E. Holly Ave.
El Segundo, CA 90245
Attn: Chirag Shah, M.D.

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Dr. Shah,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

QCare Plus
1800 2nd St., Suite 735
Sarasota, FL 34236
Attn: Quinton Raspberry, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Raspberry,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Quick MD
267 Willis St., Suite 200
Redding, CA 96001
Attn: Drew Young, Regulatory & Compliance Director

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Young,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Relief Labs, Inc. d/b/a Clearing
50 W. 72nd St., Suite 1002
New York, NY 10023
Attn: Avi Dorfman, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Dorfman,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Remedy Psychiatry
200 South Barrington Ave.
P.O. Box 492124
Los Angeles, CA 90049
Attn: Kirsten Thompson, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Thompson,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Renown Health
50 West Liberty Street, 11th Floor
Reno, NV 89501
Attn: Jamie Winter, Deputy Chief Legal Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Winter,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Riverside Health System
701 Town Center Dr., Suite 1000
Newport News, VA 23606
Attn: Jason Houser, Senior VP and General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Houser,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Rochester Regional Health
100 Kings Highway
South Rochester, NY 14617
Attn: K. Ellen Gallagher, Senior VP, Chief Audit, Compliance & Privacy Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Gallagher,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Roman
116 W. 23rd St, Floor 4
New York, NY 10011
Attn: Zachariah Reitano, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Reitano,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Rush University Medical Center
1620 W Harrison St.
Chicago, IL 60612
Attn: Carl Bergetz, General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Bergetz,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Salem Health
890 Oak St. SE
Salem, OR 97301
Attn: John Bauer, Chief Legal Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Bauer,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Sanford USD Medical Center
5709 S. Shadow Ridge Ave.
Sioux Falls, SD 57108
Attn: Jennifer Grennan, Executive Vice President & Chief Administrative Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Grennan,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Sarasota Memorial Health Care System
1700 S. Tamiami Trail
Sarasota, FL 34239-3509
Attn: Carol Ann Kalish, Chief Legal Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Kalish,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Scripps Memorial Hospital La Jolla - Scripps Health
10140 Campus Point Dr., Cpa 415,
San Diego, CA 92121-1520
Attn: Bradley S. Ellis, Senior VP & Chief Legal Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Ellis,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Sharp Healthcare
8520 Tech Way, Suite 200
San Diego, CA 92123
Attn: Rick Grossman, Senior Vice President and General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Grossman,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Sparrow Health Systems
1215 E. Michigan Ave.
Lansing, MI 48912
Attn: Andrea Kosloski, Vice President of Legal and Risk Management

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Kosloski,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

St. Joseph Mercy Health System
5301 McAuley Dr.
Ypsilanti, MI 48197
Attn: Sally Guindi, Chief Division Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Guindi,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

St. Luke's Health System
190 E. Bannock St.
Boise, ID 83712
Attn: Christina Neuhoff, Senior VP and Chief Legal Office

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Neuhoff,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

St. Tammany Health System
140 President Madison Dr.
Madisonville, LA 70447
Attn: Lesleigh Hall, AVP Legal Affairs

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Hall,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Strut Health
701 Commerce St.
Dallas, TX 75202-4522
Attn: Simal Patel, M.D., CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Dr. Patel,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Talkiatry
109 W. 27th St., Suite 5S
New York, NY 10001
Attn: Robert Krayn, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Krayn,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Talkspace
33 W. 60th St., 8th Floor
New York, NY 10023
Attn: Jon Cohen, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Dr. Cohen,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Tampa General Hospital
1 Tampa General Circle
Tampa, FL 33606
Attn: John Couris, President & CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Couris,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Texas Health Resources
612 E. Lamar Blvd., Suite 900
Arlington, TX 76011
Attn: Kenneth J. Kramer, General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Kramer,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

The Wellness Company
132 George M. Cohan Blvd.
Providence, RI 02904
Attn: Foster Coulson, Chairman

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Coulson,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Thomas Jefferson Hospital
Office of Legal Affairs
1101 Market Street
Jefferson Tower, Suite 2400
Philadelphia, PA 19107
Attn: Cristina G. Cavalieri, Executive VP, Chief Legal and Risk Affairs Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Cavalieri,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023-186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Tufts Medical Center
800 Washington St.
Boston, MA 02111
Attn: Zachary Redmond, General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Redmond,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

UC Davis Health
4610 X Street
Sacramento, CA 95817-2200
Attn: Anna Orłowski, Chief Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Orłowski,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

UCLA Reagan Medical Center
c/o Office of the General Counsel
University of California
1111 Franklin St., 8th Floor
Oakland, CA 94607
Attn: Charles F. Robinson, General Counsel & Senior VP for Legal Affairs, UCLA Health

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Robinson,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023-186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

UCSF Office of Legal Affairs
745 Parnassus Ave., 2nd Floor
San Francisco, CA 94143-0986
Attn: Greta W. Schnetzler, Associate General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Schnetzler,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

UnityPoint Health
1776 West Lakes Parkway, Suite 400
West Des Moines, IA 50266
Attn: Scott Kizer, Senior Vice President & General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Kizer,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

University Hospitals Cleveland Medical Center
3605 Warrensville Center Rd.
Mail Stop MSC #9105
Shaker Heights, OH 44122
Attn: Harlin G. Adelman, Chief Legal Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Adelman,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

University of Chicago Medicine
5841 South Maryland Avenue
MC 1132
Chicago, IL 60637
Attn: John Satalic, General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Satalic,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

University of Iowa Hospitals and Clinics
200 Hawkins Drive
Iowa City, IA 52242
Attn: Brooks Jackson, M.D., Vice President for Medical Affairs

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Dr. Jackson,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

University of Kansas Health System
4000 Cambridge St.
Kansas City, KS 66160-8501
Attn: Daniel Peters, Senior Vice President & General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Peters,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

University of Pittsburgh Medical Center
U.S. Steel Tower
600 Grant Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15219

Attn: Walter Thomas McGough, Jr., Executive Vice President & Chief Legal Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. McGough,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

University of Texas Southwestern Medical Center
5323 Harry Hines Blvd.
Dallas, TX 75390
Attn: Erin Sine, Vice President for Legal Affairs

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Sine,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

University of Vermont Health Network
Porter Medical Center
115 Porter Drive
Middlebury, VT 05753
Attn: Marianne Bruno, Compliance and Privacy Officer

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Bruno,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Wexner Medical Center
1590 N. High St., Suite 500
Columbus, OH 43201-2247
Attn: Anne K. Garcia, Senior Vice President & General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. Garcia,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Willis-Knighton Health System
2600 Greenwood Rd.
Shreveport, LA 71103
Attn: Jaf Fielder, President & CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Fielder,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter; U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.>, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Wisp
28 Baker St., #B
San Francisco, CA 94117
Attn: Ahmad Bani, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Bani,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Wondermed
828 Crestmoore Pl.
Venice, CA 90291
Attn: Ryan Magnussen, CEO

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Magnussen,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual's personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate ("regulated entities") under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR's December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer's authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC's Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm'n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Workit
4730 North Habana Ave., Suite 206
Tampa, FL 33614
Attn: Robin Ann McIntosh

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Ms. McIntosh,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v; In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc; In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.>, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.



July 20, 2023

Yale New Haven Health
789 Howard Ave.
New Haven, CT 06519
Attn: William J. Aseltyn, Executive Vice President & General Counsel

Re: Use of Online Tracking Technologies

Dear Mr. Aseltyn,

The Office for Civil Rights (OCR) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) are writing to draw your attention to serious privacy and security risks related to the use of online tracking technologies that may be present on your website or mobile application (app) and impermissibly disclosing consumers' sensitive personal health information to third parties.

Recent research,¹ news reports,² FTC enforcement actions,³ and an OCR bulletin⁴ have highlighted risks and concerns about the use of technologies, such as the Meta/Facebook pixel and Google Analytics, that can track a user's online activities. These tracking technologies

¹ See, e.g., Mingjia Huo, Maxwell Bland, and Kirill Levchenko, *All Eyes on Me: Inside Third Party Trackers' Exfiltration of PHI from Healthcare Providers' Online Systems*, Proceedings of the 21st Workshop on Privacy in the Electronic Society (Nov. 7, 2022), <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3559613.3563190>.

² See, e.g., Todd Feathers, Katie Palmer, and Simon Fondrie-Teitler, *Out of Control: Dozens of Telehealth Startups Sent Sensitive Health Information to Big Tech Companies*, THE MARKUP (Dec. 13, 2022), <https://themarkup.org/pixel-hunt/2022/12/13/out-of-control-dozens-of-telehealth-startups-sent-sensitive-health-information-to-big-tech-companies>.

³ *U.S. v. Easy Healthcare Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-3107 (N.D. Ill. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/202-3186-easy-healthcare-corporation-us-v>; *In the Matter of BetterHelp, Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4796 (July 14, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023169-betterhelp-inc-matter>; *U.S. v. GoodRx Holdings, Inc.*, Case No. 23-cv-460 (N.D. Cal. 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/2023090-goodrx-holdings-inc>; *In the Matter of Flo Health Inc.*, FTC Dkt. No. C-4747 (June 22, 2021), <https://www.ftc.gov/legal-library/browse/cases-proceedings/192-3133-flo-health-inc>.

⁴ U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Svcs. Office for Civil Rights, *Use of Online Tracking Technologies by HIPAA Covered Entities and Business Associates* (Dec. 1, 2022), <https://www.hhs.gov/hipaa/for-professionals/privacy/guidance/hipaa-online-tracking/index.html>.

gather identifiable information about users as they interact with a website or mobile app, often in ways which are not avoidable by and largely unknown to users.

Impermissible disclosures of an individual’s personal health information to third parties may result in a wide range of harms to an individual or others. Such disclosures can reveal sensitive information including health conditions, diagnoses, medications, medical treatments, frequency of visits to health care professionals, where an individual seeks medical treatment, and more. In addition, impermissible disclosures of personal health information may result in identity theft, financial loss, discrimination, stigma, mental anguish, or other serious negative consequences to the reputation, health, or physical safety of the individual or to others.

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA)

If you are a covered entity or business associate (“regulated entities”) under HIPAA, you must comply with the HIPAA Privacy, Security, and Breach Notification Rules (HIPAA Rules), with regard to protected health information (PHI) that is transmitted or maintained in electronic or any other form or medium.

The HIPAA Rules apply when the information that a regulated entity collects through tracking technologies or discloses to third parties (*e.g.*, tracking technology vendors) includes PHI. HIPAA regulated entities are not permitted to use tracking technologies in a manner that would result in impermissible disclosures of PHI to third parties or any other violations of the HIPAA Rules. OCR’s December 2022 bulletin about the use of online tracking technologies by HIPAA regulated entities provides a general overview of how the HIPAA Rules apply.⁵ This bulletin discusses what tracking technologies are and reminds regulated entities of their obligations to comply with the HIPAA Rules when using tracking technologies.

FTC Act and FTC Health Breach Notification Rule

Even if you are not covered by HIPAA, you still have an obligation to protect against impermissible disclosures of personal health information under the FTC Act and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule. This is true even if you relied upon a third party to develop your website or mobile app and even if you do not use the information obtained through use of a tracking technology for any marketing purposes. As recent FTC enforcement actions demonstrate, it is essential to monitor data flows of health information to third parties via technologies you have integrated into your website or app.⁶ The disclosure of such information without a consumer’s authorization can, in some circumstances, violate the FTC Act as well as constitute a breach of security under the FTC’s Health Breach Notification Rule.⁷ Within the last

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *See supra* note 3.

⁷ *See* Federal Trade Comm’n, *Statement of the Commission on Breaches by Health Apps and Other Connected Devices* (Sept. 15, 2021), https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1596364/statement_of_the_commission_on_breaches_by_health_apps_and_other_connected_devices.pdf.

few months, the FTC has issued a series of guidance pieces addressed to entities collecting, using, or disclosing sensitive health information.⁸

OCR and the FTC remain committed to ensuring that consumers' health privacy remains protected with respect to this critical issue. Both agencies are closely watching developments in this area. To the extent you are using the tracking technologies described in this letter on your website or app, we strongly encourage you to review the laws cited in this letter and take actions to protect the privacy and security of individuals' health information.⁹

Sincerely,

(b)(6)

Melanie Fontes Rainer
Director
Office for Civil Rights
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

(b)(6)

Samuel Levine
Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Federal Trade Commission

⁸ See, e.g., FTC Office of Technology, *Lurking Beneath the Surface: Hidden Impacts of Pixel Tracking* (Mar. 16, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/policy/advocacy-research/tech-at-ftc/2023/03/lurking-beneath-surface-hidden-impacts-pixel-tracking>; Lesley Fair, *First FTC Health Breach Notification Rule case addresses GoodRx's not-so-good privacy practices* (Feb. 1, 2023), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2023/02/first-ftc-health-breach-notification-rule-case-addresses-goodrxs-not-so-good-privacy-practices>; Federal Trade Comm'n and the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services' Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology (ONC), Office for Civil Rights (OCR), and Food and Drug Administration (FDA), *Mobile Health App Interactive Tool* (Dec. 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/resources/mobile-health-apps-interactive-tool>; Kristin Cohen, *Location, health, and other sensitive information: FTC Committed to fully enforcing the law against illegal use and sharing of highly sensitive data* (July 11, 2022), <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance/blog/2022/07/location-health-and-other-sensitive-information-ftc-committed-fully-enforcing-law-against-illegal>.

⁹ In addition to the HIPAA Rules, the FTC Act, and the FTC Health Breach Notification Rule, you may also be subject to other state or federal statutes that prohibit the disclosure of personal health information.